

Remarks

Applicants note that all pending claims stand rejected. Claims 1 and 12 have been amended. Claims 1 - 3 and 5 - 14 remain for consideration.

Applicants submit that currently amended claims 1 and 12 are patentable over WO99/67435 to Esser.

Esser has been discussed at in previous Office Actions and Amendments.

In Esser, the castings were heat treated - at a temperature of about 2300 F (page 8, line 5). Such a heat treatment, applied to the present invention, would destroy the part. Currently amended claims 1 and 12 now reflect that the present invention articles have good properties in the absence of a relatively high temperature solution heat treatment. Such limitation is not new matter, as the relevant language is reflected in various parts of the original specification.

Applicants also submit currently amended claims 1 and 12 are patentable over EP 0 855 449 to Mitsubishi.

In Mitsubishi, the castings are HIPd at ~ 2150 - 2300 for 1 - 5 hours, and then heat treated at a temperature of 2200 - 2300 F for 2 - 5 hours. Currently amended claims 1 and 12 now reflect that the present invention articles have good properties in the absence of a relatively high temperature solution heat treatment.

For at least the foregoing reasons, Applicants submit that neither Esser nor Mitsubishi teach or suggest the invention as set forth in independent claims 1 and 12. The dependent claims further define the inventions of their respective independent claims, and are thus deemed further patentable.

Applicants believe that there are no fees due for submitting this Amendment. Please charge our Deposit Account No. 21-0279 for any fees.

For at least the foregoing reasons, Applicants submit that the independent claims 1 and 12 and their respective dependent claims are allowable over the prior art of record. The Examiner is invited to contact the undersigned if there are any questions.

Respectfully submitted,



F. Tyler Morrison  
Registration Number 36,220  
Attorney for Applicants

Pratt & Whitney  
Patent Department  
Mail Stop 132-13  
400 Main Street  
East Hartford, CT 06108  
Voice: 860.565.3120  
Fax: 860.557.9883